BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06087933 5

Materials for

# LEGAL PROCESS (SECTIONS I AND II)
# FIRST YEAR 2003-2004

## FALL 2003

## VOLUME I

Professor Ayelet Shachar
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Storage

KE
8348.5
.S43
2003
v.1
c.1

als reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto, Faculty of Law and are not for commercial sale or use.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 2 8 2003
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Materials for

# LEGAL PROCESS (SECTIONS I AND II)
# FIRST YEAR 2003-2004

## FALL 2003

## VOLUME I

Professor Ayelet Shachar
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

The materials reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto, Faculty of Law and are not for commercial sale or use.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/materialsforlega01shac_1

**LEGAL PROCESS**

**Fall 2003**

**Professor Ayelet Shachar**

## 1 Introduction to the common law system

### 1.1 Boundaries of Civil Litigation

Kenneth E. Scott, "Two Models of the Civil Process," Vol. 27 *Stanford Law Review* 937 (1975) (excerpt) ..... 1

Adria Vasil, "Fast Food's Big Choke," Vol.22, No.43 NOW (2003) ..... 4

Albie L. Sachs, "Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century: Real Dichotomies, False Antagonisms" (excerpt) ..... 9

### 1.2 Precedent; *stare decisis*; binding authority; persuasive authority

G. L. Gall, "The Doctrine of Precedent and *Stare Decisis*" ..... 14

*Chart of Ontario's Court System* in Garry D. Watson, *The civil litigation process: cases and materials* (Toronto: Emond Montgomery, 1999) at 38 ..... 18

*Charts of Persuasive and Binding Authority in Comparative Context* in Gerald L. Gall, *The Canadian legal system* (Toronto: Carswell, 1995) at 182-186. ..... 19

*Halpern v. Canada* (Attorney General), Court of Appeal for Ontario, File C39172, decision given on June 10, 2003 ..... 22

Claire Hoy, "Doing it democratically" *Law Times*, July 29, 2002, 7 ..... 29

Department of Justice, "Minister of Justice Announces Reference to the Supreme Court of Canada," July 17, 2003 ..... 30

"No Same Sex Marriage in N.B. until Law Passes," *The Chronicle-Herald*, July 24, 2003 D18 ..... 32

**Recommended:**

Eleanor Brown, "Why be Wedded to Gay Marriage?" *The Globe and Mail*, August 8, 2002 A7 ..... 33

### 1.3 Philosophies of law and government; analytical frameworks

**Purposive interpretation; positive law; legal realism; formalism; law and economics; anti-subordination approaches (critical legal studies, feminism, critical race theory)**

Lon L. Fuller, "The Case of the Speluncean Explorers" (1999) 112 Harvard Law Review 1834. ....34

**Recommended:**

Paul N. Cox, "An Interpretation and (Partial) Defense of Legal Formalism," 36 *Indiana Law Review* 57 (2003) (excerpt)....51

Brian Leiter, "American Legal Realism," forthcoming in *The Blackwell Guide to Philosophy of Law and Legal Theory* (excerpt)....56

Nicholas Mercuro & Steven G. Medema, *Economics and the Law: from Posner to post-modernism* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1997) at 5-25. ....60

Patricia J. Williams, *The alchemy of race and rights* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1991) at 146-148....70

### 1.4 Legal Reasoning

Catherine A. MacKinnon, "Equality Under Law," in *Sex Equality* (Foundation Press, 2001) (excerpt) ....72

Allan C. Hutchinson, *The law school book: succeeding at law school*, 2nd ed. (Toronto: Irwin Law, 2000) at 25-38....76

*Law Society of British Columbia v. Andrews*, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 143. ....90

*Lavoie v. Canada*, 2002 SCC 23....96

## 2 The litigation process and the Rules of Civil Procedure

### 2.1 Parties to the litigation; amici curiae; standing; intervention

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.13, amended to O. Reg. 263/03. ....106

*Borowski v. Canada (Minister of Justice)* (1983), 144 D.L.R. (3d) 657 (Sask. Q.B.)....107

*Canadian Council of Churches v. Canada*, [1992] 1 S.C.R. 236....109

Cristin Schmitz, "Intervenors set record, Supreme Court 'restrained' in 2000" *The Lawyers Weekly* 20:46, April 13, 2001, 7....113

Harvard University et. al, "Interest of Amici Curiae" (2002) ....114

Charles R. Epp, "Do Bills of Rights Matter? The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms" (1996) 90:4 American Political Science Review 765....121

**Recommended:**

*Canadian Civil Liberties Association v. Canada (A.G.)*, [1998] O.J. No. 2856.....126

Jacques Steinberg, "After 25 Years, a Road Map for Diversity on Campus," *The New York Times*, June 24, 2003.....147

### 2.2 Where to litigate; jurisdiction and *forum non conveniens*

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.17, amended to O. Reg. 263/03.....150

*Morguard Investment Ltd. V. De Savoye*.....155

Bill Miller & Christine Haughney, "Old Law Creates Forum for War-Crimes Trials" *The Toronto Star*, August 13, 2000, B1.....157

*Santa Clara Pueblo v. Martinez*, 436 U.S. 49 (1978).....159

*Carnival Cruise Lines v. Shute*, 499 U.S. 585 (1991).....166

**Recommended:**

Hague Conference, *Preliminary Draft Convention on Jurisdiction and the Effects of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters*, October 30, 1999.....176

### 2.3 When to litigate; limitation periods

*Consumers Glass v. Foundation Company of Canada* (1985), 51 O.R. (2d) 385 (Ont. C.A.).....181

Janet E. Mosher, "Challenging Limitation Periods: Civil Claims by Adult Survivors of Incest" (1994) 44 University of Toronto Law Journal 169.....184

*M.(K.) v. M.(H.)*, [1992] 3 S.C.R. 6.....189

Fox Butterfield, "789 Children Abused by Priests Since 1940, Massachusetts Says," *New York Times*, July 24, 2003.....195

Limitations Act 2002.....198

**Recommended:**

Andrew T. Kenyon & Simon Mackenzie, *Recovering Stolen Art: Australian, English and US Law on Limitations of Action* (Public Law & Legal Theory Working Paper No. 23, Faculty of Law, University of Melbourne, 2002).....216

William K. Rashbaum, "New York Pursues Old Cases Based Just on DNA," *The New York Times*, August 5, 2003.....227

### 2.4 Multi-party litigation; joinder; counterclaims; cross-claims; third-party claims

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.5, amended to O. Reg. 263/03 .....229

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.27, amended to O. Reg. 263/03 .....232

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.28, amended to O. Reg. 263/03. .....236

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.29, amended to O. Reg. 263/03. .....240

*Teledata Communications v. Westburne Industrial (1990)*, 71 O.R. (3d) 466 (H.C.). .....245

Marc Edge, "SLAPPed Down" *National (Canadian Bar Association)* (June-July 2000) 11. .....247

### 2.5 Class proceedings

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.12, amended to O. Reg. 263/03. .....252

*Class Proceedings Act, 1992*, S.O. 1992, c. 6. .....255

Kirk Makin, "Class-action Suits Explode into 'National Phenomenon'" *The Globe and Mail*, July 19, 2003 .....279

*Anderson v. Wilson*, [1999] O.J. no. 2494 (C.A.). .....281

*Nantais v. Telectronics Proprietary (1995)*, 25 O.R. (3d) 331 (Gen. Div), aff'd (Div. Ct.), at 347. .....286

*Hollick v. Toronto (City)*, 2001 SCC 68. .....288

Thomas Claridge, "Appeal Court Narrowly Rejects Proposed Mohawk Class Action," *The Lawyers Weekly*, July 18, 2003 .....294

Deborah Glendinning & Meredith Gardiner, "International Class Action: Fact or Fiction?" *The Lawyers Weekly*, June 7, 2002, 17. .....295

**Recommended:**

Garry D. Watson, "Class Actions: The Canadian Experience" (2001) 11 Duke Journal of Comparative & International Law 269 .....297

Michelle Taruffo, "Some Remarks on Group Litigation in Comparative Perspective" (2001) 11 Duke Journal of Comparative & International Law 405.....307

### 2.6 Financing litigation; contingency fees; paralegals; insurance plans

Justice Statute Amendment Act, 2002 ..... 316

Poonam Puri, "Financing of Litigation by Third-Party Investors: A Share of Justice?" (1998) 36 Osgoode Hall Law Journal 515 ..... 321

McIntyre Estate v. Ontario (Attorney General) ..... 329

Julius Melnitzer, "The Business of Running a Class Action," *Law Times*, July 14, 2003 ..... 335

Ministry of the Attorney General, "Regulation of Contingency Fees in Ontario," 2002 ..... 337

"Private Insurance" ..... 339

"Paralegals" ..... 341

"Legal software" ..... 342

**Recommended:**

Peter deC. Cory, *A Framework For Regulating Paralegal Practice in Ontario: Executive Summary and Recommendations* (Ministry of the Attorney General, Ontario, Canada, 2000) ..... 344

Gillian K. Hadfield, "The Price of Law: How the Market for Lawyers Distorts the Justice System," 98 *Michigan Law Review* 953 (2000) (excerpt) ..... 346

### 2.7 Access to justice

Lucie E. White, "Subordination, Rhetorical Survival Skills, and Sunday Shoes: Notes on the Hearing of Mrs. G," (1990) 38 Buffalo Law Review 1 ..... 366

Stephen Ellman, "Client-Centredness Multiplied" (1992) 78 Virginia Law Review 1103 at 1104-1170. ..... 378

Legal Aid Ontario, "About Legal Aid Ontario"(2003) ..... 384

Kirk Makin, "A taste of life in the legal aid trenches" *The Globe and Mail*, July 8 2002, B9 ..... 385

**Recommended:**

John D. McCamus, "The Reshaping of Legal Aid" in William A. Bogart, *Access to affordable and appropriate legal services in 2020* (Windsor, Ontario: Canadian Bar Association, 2000) 41 ..... 386

## 2.8 Discovery; privilege and confidentiality

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.30, amended to O. Reg. 263/03 ..... 399

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.31, amended to O. Reg. 263/03. ..... 407

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.34, amended to O. Reg. 263/03. ..... 416

*Grossman v. Toronto General Hospital* (1983), 146 D.L.R. (3d) 280 (Ont. H.C.) ..... 426

*Rainbow Industrial Caterers v. Canadian National Railway* (1986), 6 B.C.L.R. (2d) 268 (S.C.). ..... 429

*Smith v. Jones*, [1991] 1 S.C.R. 455. ..... 430

*Ontario (Ministry of Environment) v. McCarthy Terault* ..... 438

Gavin MacKenzie, "Is keeping secrets in client's best interest?" *Law Times*, February 28, 2000, 8. ..... 441

Robert A. Kagan, "Adversarial Legalism and Civil Justice," in *Adversarial Legalism* (Harvard, 2001) (excerpt) ..... 443

**Recommended:**

Jonathan Harr, *A Civil Action* (New York: Vintage Books) at 149-193 ..... 451

Cynthia Day Wallace, "'Extraterritorial' Discovery: Ongoing Challenges for Antitrust Litigation in an Environment of Global Investment" (2002) 5 Journal of International Economic Law 353 ..... 476

## 2.9 Settlement

Owen M. Fiss, "Against Settlement" (1984) 98 Yale Law Journal 1073 at 1075-1090 ..... 485

Chris A. Carr & Michael R. Jencks, "The Privatization of Business and Commercial Dispute Resolution: A Misguided Policy Decision" (2000) 88 Kentucky Law Journal 183 ..... 488

Michael P. Silver, *Mediation and negotiation: representing your clients* (Markham, Ontario: Butterworths, 2001) at 3-14 ..... 496

Daniel Girard, "Teen bully finds justice, healing and the courage to apologize" *The Toronto Star*, May 15, 2002, A7 ..... 502

*Rules of Civil Procedure*, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.24.1, amended to O. Reg. 263/03 ..... 503

Superior Court of Justice, "Civil Case Management: Toronto Update," Summer 2003 ..... 511

**Recommended:**

Donna Coker, "Enhancing Autonomy for Battered Women: Lessons from Navajo Peacemaking" (1999) 47 UCLA Law Review 1 ..... 512

Ann Kerr, "Mandatory Mediation Grows in Popularity," *The Globe and Mail*, June 17, 2002, B10 ..... 528

### 2.10 Alternative dispute resolution; mediation and negotiation

Elizabeth Kiss, "Moral Ambition Within and Beyond Political Constraints: Reflections on Restorative Justice," in *Truth v. Justice* (Princeton, 2000) (excerpt) ..... 529

Mark Bovens, *The Quest for Responsibility: Accountability and Citizenship in Complex Organisation* (Cambridge, 1998) (excerpt) ..... 534

Richard Foot, "Law Firms File Details in Native Class Action," National Post, August 1, 2003, A2 ..... 547

Jennifer J. Llewellyn, "Dealing with the Legacy of Native Residential School Abuse in Canada: Litigation, ADR, and Restorative Justice" (2002) 52 University of Toronto Law Journal 253. ..... 548

*R. v. Moses (1992)*, 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Y.T. Terr. Ct.) ..... 556

**Recommended:**

Ed Morgan & Rachael Turkienicz, "The Roulette of Suffering" (2001) 9 Cardozo Journal of International and Comparative Law 297 at 314-319 ..... 565

## 3 The legal actors

### 3.1 Judges; the duty of impartiality

Peter H. Russell, "Toward a General Theory of Judicial Independence," in *Judicial Independence in the Age of Democracy* (Virginia, 2001) (excerpt) ..... 568

Jeffrey A. Segal and Harold J. Spaeth, "Models of Decision Making," in *The Supreme Court and the Attitudinal Model Revisited* (Cambridge, 2002) (excerpt) ..... 581

Rosalie Abella (Hon.), "The Case for a Strong Court: The Judiciary is Accountable to the Public Interest, Not Pubic Opinion," in *Introduction to Legal Studies* (Captus, 2001) ..... 586

Richard F. Devlin, "We Can't Go On Together with Suspicious Minds: Judicial Bias and Racialized Perspective in R. v. R.D.S." (1995) 18 Dalhousie Law Journal 408 ..... 588

"Welcome to the Court, but Fix the Entrance," *The Globe and Mail*, August 2, 2002 ..... 596

**Recommended:**

*Lennox v. Arbor Memorial Services (2001)*, 56 O.R. (3d) 795. .....598

Bertha Wilson, "Will Women Judges Really Make A Difference?" (1990) 28:3 Osgoode Hall Law Journal 507.....604

### 3.2 Lawyers; professional and legal ethics

Mary Ann Glendon, "The Lone Rights Bearer" in *Rights Talk* (Free Press, 1991) .....613

Charles Fried, "The Lawyer as Friend: The Moral Foundations of Lawyer-Client Relations" (1976) 85 Yale Law Journal 1060 at 1060-1067, 1076-1087. .....614

Duncan Kennedy, "The Responsibility of Lawyers for the Justice of Their Causes" (1987) 18 Texas Technical Law Review 1157. .....620

Erin Anderssen, "Lawyers swoop to cash in on native claims" *The Globe and Mail*, July 10, 1999, A1 .....623

Roger C. Cramton, "Lawyer conduct in the 'Tobacco Wars'" (2001) 51 DePaul Law Review 435. .....625

The Law Society of Upper Canada, "Rules of Professional Conduct: Executive Summary" .....637

**Recommended:**

"A fresh look at the Rules of Professional Conduct" *Ontario Lawyers Gazette* 4:3 (July-August 2000) 32. .....641

Janine Benedet, "When the Law Society is an Ass" *The Globe and Mail*, November 15, 1999, A17. .....649

## 4 The new frontiers of civil procedure: beyond adversarial legalism; domestic, regional, and international justice

### 4.1 Redefining Domestic Law: Challenging Traditional Jurisdictional Boundaries From Within the State

Ayelet Shachar, *Multicultural jurisdictions: Cultural Differences and Women's Rights* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2001) at 88-116 .....650

John Burrows, *Recovering Canada: The Resurgence of Indigenous Law* (Toronto, 2002) (excerpt) .....666

ECHR Incorporation into Domestic Law: The Human Rights Act 1998 and the Scotland Act 1998, The Scottish Parliament Information Centre, January 15, 2001 .....672

"Government to 'Bring Rights Home' on 2 October 2000," The Lord Chancellor's Department, Human Rights News Release, December 7, 2000 .....676

*Baker v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)*, [1999] 2 S.C.R. 817.....677

Simon Coldham, "Human rights in Botswana: Unity Dow v. Attorney-General" (1992) 36 Journal of African Law 91 .....681

**Recommended:**

*Nisga'a Final Agreement*, signed on behalf of the Nisga'a Nation and Her Majesty in right of British Columbia on April 27, 1999 and on behalf of Her Majesty in right of Canada on May 4, 1999 and laid before the House of Commons on October 19, 1999, at paras. 39-40, 75-107. .....683

### 4.2. Cross-Border and Transnational Legal Challenges in the Era of Globalization

David Held, "Democracy and Globalization," in *Re-imagining Political Community* (Polity, 1998).....700

*Presbyterian Church of Sudan v. Talisman* .....709

William Glaberson, "U.S. Courts Become Arbitrators of Global Rights and Wrongs," *The New York Times,* June 21, 2001.....717

"Universal Incompetence," *The Economist*, June 26, 2003.....720

Anne Marie Slaughter, "The Real New World Order," 76 *Foreign Affairs* 183 (1997).....721

Patrick Macklem & Ed Morgan, "Intervention at the Inter-American Court" *Nexus: University of Toronto Faculty of Law alumni newsletter* (Spring 2002) 68.....729

**Recommended:**

American Law Institute, "Transnational Rules of Civil Procedure: Preliminary Draft No. 1: Commentary," 33 *Texas International Law Journal* 513 (1998) .....731

James Crawford and Susan Marks, "The Global Democratic Deficit," in *Re-imagining Political Community* (Polity, 1998) (excerpt) .....746

### 4.2 Supra-national institutions: "supreme" to the Supreme Court of Canada?

*Lovelace v. Canada*, UN GOAR, 36th Sess., Supp. No. 40, UN Doc. A/36/40 (1981).....756

Susan Esserman and Robert Howse, "The WTO on Trial," *Foreign Affairs,* January/February 2003.....759

"Not (quite) strangled at birth: The International Criminal Court" *The Economist* 364, July 6, 2002, 14.....770

**Recommended:**

Joseph H.H. Weiler, *The constitution of Europe: "Do the new clothes have an emperor" and other essays on European integration* (Cambridge, 1999) at 39-43 .....772

Dan C. Esty, "The World Trade Organization's Legitimacy Crisis," 1 *World Trade Review* 7 (2002) .....775

**POSTSCRIPT**

Jessica Leeder, "A Breakfast Date at the Courthouse," *The Toronto Star*, August 4, 2003, E3 .....791

"Q: 'Who is International President of the 1991 Nobel Peace Prize-Winning *Doctors Without Borders?*'; A: 'University of Toronto Graduate James Orbinski,'" *University of Toronto National Report* (1999) .....793